

A Companion to Mill

Edited by

Christopher Macleod and Dale E. Miller

WILEY Blackwell

This edition first published 2017
© 2017 John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK
The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The rights of Christopher Macleod and Dale E. Miller to be identified as the authors of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and editors have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Macleod, Christopher, editor.

Title: A companion to Mill / edited by Christopher Macleod and Dale E. Miller.

Description: Hoboken : Wiley, 2016. | Series: Blackwell companions to philosophy |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016024934 (print) | LCCN 2016033880 (ebook) | ISBN

9781118736524 (cloth) | ISBN 9781118736364 (pdf) | ISBN 9781118736463 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Mill, John Stuart, 1806–1873.

Classification: LCC B1607 .C58 2016 (print) | LCC B1607 (ebook) | DDC 192–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016024934>

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover image: [Production Editor to insert]

Set in in 10/12.5pt Photina by SPi Global, Pondicherry, India

Contents

<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	viii
<i>Preface</i>	xiv
<i>Note on Citations</i>	xvii
Part I Mill's Autobiography and Biography	1
1 Mill's Mind: A Biographical Sketch <i>Richard V. Reeves</i>	3
2 Mill's Epiphanies <i>Elijah Millgram</i>	12
3 The Afterlife of John Stuart Mill, 1874–1879 <i>David Stack</i>	30
4 Mill's <i>Autobiography</i> as Literature <i>Samuel Clark</i>	45
Part II Influences on Mill's Thought	59
5 Mill and the Classics <i>Robert Devigne</i>	61
6 Roots of Mill's Radicalism <i>Peter Niesen</i>	79
7 British Critics of Utilitarianism <i>Bruce Kinzer</i>	95
8 Harriet Taylor Mill <i>Helen McCabe</i>	112
9 The French Influence <i>Vincent Guillin</i>	126
Part III Foundations of Mill's Thought	143
10 Psychology, Associationism, and Ethology <i>Terence Ball</i>	145

CONTENTS

11	Mill on Race and Gender <i>C.L. Ten</i>	160
12	Mill on Logic <i>David Godden</i>	175
13	Mill's Epistemology <i>Richard Fumerton</i>	192
14	Mill's Philosophy of Language <i>Frederick Kroon</i>	207
15	Mill on Metaphysics <i>Nicholas Capaldi</i>	222
16	Mill's Philosophy of Science <i>Aaron D. Cobb</i>	234
17	Mill's Aesthetics <i>Antis Loizides</i>	250
18	Mill on History <i>Christopher Macleod</i>	266
19	Mill's Philosophy of Religion <i>Lou J. Matz</i>	279
	Part IV Mill's Moral Philosophy	295
20	Mill's Art of Life <i>Guy Fletcher</i>	297
21	Mill's Conception of Happiness <i>Ben Saunders</i>	313
22	The Proof <i>Henry R. West</i>	328
23	Mill on Utilitarian Sanctions <i>Jonathan Riley</i>	342
24	Mill's Moral Standard <i>Ben Eggleston</i>	358
25	Mill on Justice and Rights <i>David O. Brink</i>	374
26	Mill and Virtue <i>Brian McElwee</i>	390

Part V Mill's Social Philosophy	407
27 The Harm Principle <i>D.G. Brown</i>	409
28 Mill on Individuality <i>Wendy Donner</i>	425
29 Mill on Freedom of Speech <i>Daniel Jacobson</i>	440
30 Mill on Democracy Revisited <i>Georgios Varouxakis</i>	454
31 Mill on the Family <i>Dale E. Miller</i>	472
32 Mill's Normative Economics <i>Gerald Gaus</i>	488
33 Mill on Education and Schooling <i>Graham Finlay</i>	504
34 Mill on Colonialism <i>Don A. Habibi</i>	518
Part VI Mill and Later Movements in Philosophy	533
35 Mill, German Idealism, and the Analytic/Continental Divide <i>John Skorupski</i>	535
36 Mill and Modern Utilitarianism <i>William H. Shaw</i>	551
37 Mill and Modern Liberalism <i>Piers Norris Turner</i>	567
<i>Index</i>	583

Notes on Contributors

Terence Ball is Emeritus Professor of Political Science and Philosophy at Arizona State University, to which he moved in 1998 after a long career at the University of Minnesota. He has held visiting appointments at Cambridge, Oxford, and the University of California, San Diego. He is the author of several books, including *Transforming Political Discourse: Political Theory and Critical Conceptual History* (1988), *Reappraising Political Theory: Revisionist Studies in the History of Political Thought* (1995), and a mystery novel, *Rousseau's Ghost* (1998). He is coeditor (with Richard Bellamy) of *The Cambridge History of Twentieth-Century Political Thought* and for the Cambridge Texts series has edited *James Mill: Political Writings* (1992), *The Federalist* (2003), *Abraham Lincoln: Political Writings and Speeches* (2013), and (with Joyce Appleby) *Thomas Jefferson: Political Writings* (1999).

David O. Brink is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, San Diego. His research interests are in ethical theory, history of ethics, moral psychology, and jurisprudence. He is author of *Moral Realism and the Foundations of Ethics* (Cambridge 1989), *Perfectionism and the Common Good: Themes in the Philosophy of T.H. Green* (Oxford 2003), and *Mill's Progressive Principles* (Oxford 2013).

D.G. Brown who sadly passed away just as this volume went to press, was Professor Emeritus at the University of British Columbia. He was a Fellow of Magdalen College Oxford 1952–1955, and taught the Philosophy Department in the University British Columbia 1955–1985. His last papers on Mill include “Mill's Moral Theory: Ongoing Revisionism” (*Politics, Philosophy and Economics*, 2010), and “Mill on the Harm in Not Voting” (*Utilitas*, 2010).

Nicholas Capaldi is Legendre-Soule Distinguished Chair in Business Ethics at Loyola University New Orleans. Among his numerous publications are two books on David Hume and the Cambridge University Press intellectual biography *John Stuart Mill*.

Samuel Clark is Lecturer in Philosophy at Lancaster University, UK. He works on the nature, conditions, and ethical significance of human well-being, and on the form and value of various kinds of literary text – utopias, dialogues, autobiographies – which investigate these issues. Within these broad concerns, he has written on anarchist utopianism, on John Stuart Mill, on the roles of pleasure in good lives, on friendship and comradeship in the lives of soldiers, on David Hume, and on work and human flourishing. He has published a book, *Living Without Domination*, and articles in journals including *Res Publica*, *Philosophy*, *Inquiry*, *Ratio*, *Hume Studies*, and *The Journal of Applied Philosophy*. He is currently writing a book about autobiography and well-being.

Aaron D. Cobb is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Auburn University at Montgomery. His research focuses primarily on nineteenth-century British philosophy of science and he has published journal articles on John F.W. Herschel, William Whewell, John Stuart Mill, and Michael Faraday.

Wendy Donner is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada. She is the author of two books on John Stuart Mill – *Mill* (with Richard Fumerton, Wiley-Blackwell, 2009) and *The Liberal Self* (Cornell, 1991). She has also published many articles on Mill, environmental ethics, feminist ethics, and Buddhist ethics.

Robert Devigne is Professor of Political Science at Tufts University. He is the author of *Reforming Liberalism: J.S. Mill's Use of Ancient, Religious, Romantic and Liberal Moralities* (2006) and *Recasting Conservatism: Oakeshott, Strauss, and the Response to Postmodernism* (1994), both published by Yale University Press.

Ben Eggleston is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Kansas. He is a coeditor, with Dale E. Miller, of *The Cambridge Companion to Utilitarianism* (Cambridge University Press, 2014), and a coeditor, with Dale E. Miller and David Weinstein, of *John Stuart Mill and the Art of Life* (Oxford University Press, 2011).

Graham Finlay is a lecturer in the School of Politics and International Relations, University College Dublin. Besides articles on Mill and education, he has published articles on Mill and power, toleration and empire. Other research interests include migration and human rights.

Guy Fletcher is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh. He is interested in metaethics and ethics, and their history, and political philosophy.

Richard Fumerton received his B.A. from the University of Toronto in 1971, his Ph.D. from Brown University in 1974, and is currently the F. Wendell Miller Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. His research has focused mainly in epistemology, but he has also published books and articles on metaphysics, philosophy of mind, philosophy of science, value theory, and philosophy of law. He is the author of *Metaphysical and Epistemological Problems of Perception* (1985), *Reason and Morality: A Defense of the Egocentric Perspective* (1990), *Metaepistemology and Skepticism* (1996), *Realism and the Correspondence Theory of Truth* (2002), *Epistemology* (2006), *Mill*, co-authored with Wendy Donner (2009), and *Knowledge, Thought and The Case for Dualism* (2013).

Gerald Gaus is the James E. Rogers Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona, where he directs the program in Philosophy, Politics, Economics & Law. He is the author of a number of books, most recently *The Order of Public Reason*, published by Cambridge in 2011; with Piers Norris Turner, he is co-editor of the forthcoming *History of Public Reason in Political Philosophy* (Routledge). His most recent book, the *Tyranny of the Ideal: Justice in a Diverse Society*, is forthcoming from Princeton University Press.

David Godden received his Ph.D from McMaster University in 2004. He is an Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Michigan State University, researching in epistemology and argumentation. His previous work on Mill includes “Psychologism in the logic of John

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Stuart Mill” in *History and Philosophy of Logic* (2005), and “Mill’s *System of Logic*” in W.M. Mander’s *Oxford Handbook of British Philosophy in the Nineteenth Century* (2014).

Vincent Guillin is currently Associate Professor at the Université du Québec à Montréal, where he teaches the history and philosophy of the human sciences and the history of modern philosophy. His publications focus on John Stuart Mill, Auguste Comte, the history of nineteenth-century moral sciences. Recently, his research interests have centered on the French reception of John Stuart Mill and the history and philosophy of experimental social engineering.

Don A. Habibi is professor of philosophy at the University of North Carolina Wilmington. He specializes in social and political philosophy, ethics, and philosophy of law.

Daniel Jacobson is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Michigan. He works on a range of topics in ethics, moral psychology, aesthetics, and the moral and political philosophy of J.S. Mill. His essay, “Utilitarianism Without Consequentialism: The Case of John Stuart Mill” was chosen by *The Philosophers’ Annual* as one of the ten best philosophy articles published in 2008. He has published extensively on issues concerning sentimentalism, the relation between moral and aesthetic value, the philosophy of emotion, and freedom of speech.

Bruce Kinzer is Professor of History at Kenyon College (Ohio). Most of his scholarship has focused on J.S. Mill. He is the author of *J.S. Mill Revisited: Biographical and Political Explorations* (2007), *England’s Disgrace? J.S. Mill and the Irish Question* (2001), and co-author, with Ann P. Robson and John M. Robson, of *A Moralist In and Out of Parliament: John Stuart Mill at Westminster, 1865-1868* (1992). He joined John M. Robson in co-editing Mill’s *Public and Parliamentary Speeches*, volumes 28–9 of Mill’s *Collected Works* (1988). Apart from his contributions to Mill Studies, Kinzer has worked on various aspects of Victorian politics, editing *The Gladstonian Turn of Mind: Essays Presented to J.B. Conacher* (1985), and writing *The Ballot Question in Nineteenth-Century English Politics* (1982).

Frederick Kroon is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Auckland. His main research areas are formal and philosophical logic, philosophy of language, philosophy of science, and metaphysics, and he has authored papers in these and other areas for a range of journals, including the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, *The Philosophical Review*, *The Journal of Philosophy*, *Ethics*, and *Noûs*. His current research is mainly focused on the theory of reference and fictionalism. He is on the editorial board of the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* and is a subject editor for *Twentieth-Century Philosophy* for the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

Antis Loizides teaches at the Department of Social and Political Science, University of Cyprus. Loizides’ research interests include classical reception and the history of political thought, with a special interest in British utilitarianism and the philosophy of John Stuart Mill and James Mill. He has published articles in *Modern Intellectual History*, *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, *History of European Ideas*. He is the author of *John Stuart Mill’s Platonic Heritage: Happiness through Character* (Lexington Books, 2013) and editor of *Mill’s A System of Logic: Critical Appraisals* (Routledge, 2014). Loizides also

coedited (with K.N. Demetriou) *John Stuart Mill: A British Socrates* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2013) and *Scientific Statesmanship, Governance and the History of Political Philosophy* (Routledge, 2015).

Christopher Macleod is Lecturer in Political Philosophy at Lancaster University. He works mainly on the foundations Mill offers for his theory of practical and theoretical reason, and Mill's connections to the Kantian, post-Kantian, and Romantic traditions. Recent articles include "Was Mill a Noncognitivist?" in the *Southern Journal of Philosophy*, "Mill, Intuitions and Normativity" in *Utilitas*, and "Mill's Antirealism" in the *Philosophical Quarterly*.

Lou J. Matz is a Professor of Philosophy and an Assistant Provost at University of the Pacific in Stockton, California. He is the editor of the first annotated edition of J.S. Mill's *Three Essays on Religion* (Broadview Press, 2009) and wrote the entry on J.S. Mill in *Dictionary of Literary Biography: British Philosophers, 1800–2000* (The Gale Group, 2002).

Helen McCabe is a Teaching Fellow in Political Theory at the University of Warwick. Recent research and publications have been on Mill's socialism, his feminism, his ideas concerning distributive justice, his philosophy of persuasion, and his intellectual relationship with Harriet Taylor Mill.

Brian McElwee is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Southampton. His research focuses on the demandingness of morality, supererogation, virtue, consequentialism and the emotions. His publications include "Demandingness Objections in Ethics," *Philosophical Quarterly* (forthcoming), "The Value of the Virtues," *Utilitas* (2015), and "The Rights and Wrongs of Consequentialism," *Philosophical Studies* (2010).

Dale E. Miller is Professor of Philosophy at Old Dominion University. He is the author of *John Stuart Mill: Moral, Social and Political Thought* (2010) and an editor of *Morality, Rules, and Consequences: A Critical Reader* (with Brad Hooker and Elinor Mason, 2000), *John Stuart Mill and the Art of Life* (with Ben Eggleston and David Weinstein, 2011), and *The Cambridge Companion to Utilitarianism* (with Ben Eggleston, 2014).

Elijah Millgram is E.E. Ericksen Professor of Philosophy at the University of Utah. He has published articles on Mill in *Ethics*, the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, *Social Philosophy and Policy*, and various edited collections. His most recent books are *The Great Endarkenment* (Oxford University Press, 2015) and *Hard Truths* (Wiley-Blackwell, 2009).

Peter Niesen is Professor of Political Theory at Hamburg University. Among his recent publications are "Parole, vérité et liberté de Jeremy Bentham à John Stuart Mill," *Archives de Philosophie* (2015), and an edited volume of Bentham's Writings on the French Revolution, *Jeremy Bentham: Unsinn auf Stelzen*, Berlin: Akademie 2013.

Richard V. Reeves is the author of *John Stuart Mill: Victorian Firebrand* (Atlantic, 2007). He is a Senior Fellow in Economic Studies at the Brookings Institution in Washington DC.

Jonathan Riley is Professor of Philosophy and Political Economy, Tulane University, and a founding Editor of the Sage journal *Politics, Philosophy & Economics*. He has published extensively on Mill's philosophy. He has also received several major awards, including Killam, NEH, NHC, and Rockefeller fellowships, and has been a visiting

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

professor at the University of Chicago, the University of St Andrews, Princeton University and the University of Hamburg. His most recent publications are *Mill's On Liberty* (Routledge, 2015), which is an expanded version of *Mill on Liberty* (Routledge, 1998), and *Mill's Radical Liberalism* (forthcoming, Routledge).

Ben Saunders is Associate Professor in Political Philosophy at the University of Southampton. He is interested in most moral and political philosophy, but his main areas of research are democratic theory, John Stuart Mill, and medical ethics. He is in the early stages of a project on Mill's democratic thought.

William H. Shaw is professor of philosophy at San Jose State. He has been a research fellow or visiting professor at the University of Michigan, the University of Zimbabwe, the Freie Universität Berlin, the U.S. Naval Academy (Annapolis), and the University of Hong Kong. In addition to essays in a variety of professional journals, Bill has edited or coedited six books, including G.E. Moore's *Ethics*, *Readings in the Philosophy of Law*, and *Social and Personal Ethics*. He is the author of *Marx's Theory of History*, *Moore on Right and Wrong*, *Contemporary Ethics: Taking Account of Utilitarianism*, *Business Ethics*, and (with Vincent Barry) *Moral Issues in Business*. His most recent book is *Utilitarianism and the Ethics of War* (Routledge, 2016).

John Skorupski is Emeritus Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of St Andrews, and Visiting Professor of Philosophy at Birkbeck College London. He has worked mainly on epistemology, moral and political philosophy, and their development in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Among his publications are *John Stuart Mill* (1989), *Why Read Mill Today?* (2006), and *The Domain of Reasons* (2010).

David Stack is Professor of Modern History at the University of Reading, a historian of nineteenth century social thought, and the author of *Queen Victoria's Skull: George Combe and the Mid-Nineteenth Century Mind* (2008). He is currently completing a monograph on John Stuart Mill and natural science.

C.L. Ten is Emeritus Professor of Philosophy, National University of Singapore. He was previously Professor of Philosophy (Personal Chair), Monash University, Australia. He was elected a Fellow of the Humanities Academy in Australia, and a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia. He is the author of *Mill on Liberty*, and *Crime, Guilt, and Punishment*, as well as several collections of essays and edited books.

Piers Norris Turner is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Ohio State University. His articles on Mill's moral and political philosophy include: "Rules and Right in Mill," *Journal of the History of Philosophy* (2015), "Mill and the Liberal Rejection of Legal Moralism," *History of Philosophy Quarterly* (2015), "'Harm' and Mill's Harm Principle," *Ethics* (2014), "The Absolutism Problem in On Liberty," *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* (2013), and "Authority, Progress, and the 'Assumption of Infallibility' in On Liberty," *Journal of the History of Philosophy* (2013).

Georgios Varouxakis is Professor of the History of Political Thought at Queen Mary University of London and Co-Director of the *Centre for the Study of the History of Political Thought*. His work to date has focused mainly on nineteenth-century political thought (British and French) with a particular emphasis on John Stuart Mill. He is the author of

books such as *Mill on Nationality* (Routledge, 2002), *Victorian Political Thought on France and the French* (Palgrave Macmillan 2002), and *Liberty Abroad: J.S. Mill on International Relations* (Cambridge University Press, 2013). He is also the co-editor of the volumes *Utilitarianism and Empire* (with Bart Schultz, Lexington Books, 2005) and *John Stuart Mill – Thought and Influence: The saint of rationalism* (with Paul Kelly, Routledge, 2010).

Henry R. West is Professor of Philosophy Emeritus, Macalester College. Before Macalester he taught at MIT and at Spelman College. He has held visiting appointments at the universities of Minnesota, Chicago, and North Carolina. His works on Mill include *An Introduction to Mill's Utilitarian Ethics* (Cambridge, 2004), *The Blackwell Guide to Mill's Utilitarianism* (Blackwell, 2006), *Mill's Utilitarianism: A Reader's Guide* (Continuum, 2007), and numerous articles and reviews. On Mill's "proof," he has previously published "Reconstructing Mill's 'Proof' of the Principle of Utility," *Mind* 81 (1972), 'Mill's "Proof" of the Principle of Utility' in *The Limits of Utilitarianism* (University of Minnesota Press, 1981), and "Mill's 'Proof' of the Principle of Utility" in *The Blackwell Guide to Mill's Utilitarianism*. He resides with his wife in St. Paul, Minnesota.